Content and experiences using the *New York Times Digital* product on the Web, on a tablet (iPad), on iOS and Android smartphones were compared. Additionally, experiences across digital platforms and news aggregators were also compared. For this review, I selected one specific day: October 8, 2013.

I began the experiential comparison with the printed newspaper.

**New York Times Print Edition** (Figure 1)

At press time, the photos and articles on the front page were chosen as the primary focus of the National Edition newspaper. “Above the fold,” I found:

- Photos of mourners of Rabbi Yosef, in Jerusalem
- A photo and story about Representative Charlie Dent, a moderate Republican from Pennsylvania
- A story about California Governor Brown’s veto of a bill allowing non-citizens to serve on juries
- A story concerning the default threat generating economic fear across the globe
- And an article about escalating Egyptian attacks.

Articles about health exchange delays due to software crashes and bankruptcy in Detroit and a photo accompanying the Egypt story were found “below the fold.”

At the bottom of the page were references to articles in other sections of the paper:
- One of which was a photo of a fruit fly in flight drawing attention to an story entitled “Curiosity Takes Flight” – in the Science Times section D
- While another, “Life as Daring Art”, points to a photo expose of a controversial art exposition in Qatar.
Above the Fold

- **Photos:**
  - Mourners of Rabbi Yosef, in Jerusalem
  - Representative Charlie Dent, a moderate Republican from Pennsylvania

- **Articles:**
  - California Governor Brown’s veto of a bill allowing noncitizens to be on juries
  - GOP Moderate (Charlie Dent)
  - The default threat generating economic fear across the globe
  - Escalating Egyptian attacks

Below the Fold

- **Photos:**
  - Egyptian soldier & bombed auto

- **Articles:**
  - Skilled fund-raiser
  - Detroit Bankruptcy issues

Gutter: Index/Abstracts of Featured Sectional Stories

- International – Bias in China (Uighurs)
- LA Mayor Garcetti - National
- 3 Americans Win Nobel- National
- Weiner’s Woes- New York
- New Shopping Services – Business Day
- Puerto Rico’s Financial Trouble– Business Day
- Life as Daring Art in Qatar – Arts
- Curiosity Takes Flight – Science Times
- Baseball Playoffs – Sports
- Editorial, OP-ED
New York Times Digital Provides Access to Dynamic Content

The computer screen displayed virtually the same content as the print, but used enticing ledes to encourage the reader to click on “more” which led to the rest of the story. While many of us still enjoy reading the print newspaper, we consume news differently based on the platform. Navigating the New York Times Digital product (nytimes.com) is intuitive providing the list of news sections in the left margin. If a reader is interested in a particular topic, it is easily discovered.

Had I not been reading the nytimes.com online, I would have missed the full impact of two multimedia stories and one infographic. I was fascinated by the image of the “fruit fly” (Figure 2) on the front page of the print newspaper. It led me to the Science section where I browsed the photographs and skimmed the story. However, on the Internet, I was treated to a short and informative video explaining the many wonders of the Drosophila. It was much more instructive watching the fluttering wings of the fly while listening to the narrative than browsing the beautiful, yet flat images in the print story.

I had a similar experience watching the video and browsing the slide show depicting the creation and unveiling of Damien Hirst’s massive human gestation sculptures in Doha, Qatar (Figure 3). Photos didn’t have the impact of either the slideshow or video.

The “What is the Higgs?” (Figure 4) infographic, created by Nigel Holmes and nytimes.com graphics team clearly explained Englert and Higgs’ (newly announced Nobel Prize Winners for Physics) theory of particles acquiring mass, using a simple snow analogy. Multimedia and infographics are value-added enhancements only available on the digital versions.
New York Times Digital Provides Access to Dynamic Content

Just before noon on October 8, I compared the New York Times Digital app displays on three devices (Figure 5): an iPad, an iPhone (both IOS 7) and a Samsung Galaxy Note (Android OS). All Three devices displayed the same story leads in this order:

• Nathaniel Popper’s story – “Little Fear on Wall St. of Default, at the Moment”
• Ashley Parker’s – “A G.O.P. Moderate in the Middle... of a Jam”
• Dennis Overbye’s - “Higgs and Englert are Awarded Nobel Prize in Physics

Bylines were available on the iPad as were larger images, but leads on the iPhone and Galaxy had no bylines and the images were reduced to thumbnails.

Figure 5
New York Times Digital Provides Access to Dynamic Content

Returning to the New York Times Digital edition at 7:55 PM (Figure 6), I discovered that content I had seen on the screens before noon had been moved from the main screen into their designated subject sections.

- The story about G.O.P Representative Dent had been moved to the “Politics” section.
- The Weiner story was in the “New York/Region section
- Both the Egypt and Default Threat stories were now in the “World” section.

New, more timely stories had taken their place on the “front page.”

Since I had not monitored each of the platforms all day, I do not know how many times the digital front-page changed. Such is the dynamic nature of digital news.
News Aggregators Provide Access to Static Content

Aggregated news databases allow researchers access to digital news feeds, representing the content from print newspapers, from thousands of news organizations. Some aggregators include news blogs as well as content from news organizations’ websites, but they are essentially static snapshots of news feeds captured at one point during the day.

For this review, I chose three aggregators to which my university subscribes: Factiva, ProQuest Newsstand and Lexis Nexis Academic.

**Dow Jones Factiva** database allows limited browsing of the day’s news by presenting it on their “News Page” (Figure 7) as part of the United States group. The” News Page,” a dashboard targeting the business customer, displays top stories from a limited selection of large regional United States newspapers and business magazines. It provides “at-a-glance” access to financial, sport, weather and news. Stories found in the print edition of the *New York Times* are displayed. The reader can search through the newspaper or browse stories by section via a drop-down menu.

Many library database administrators choose to have Factiva’s “Search” page (Figure 8) act as the default starting page. Using this feature, accessing the *New York Times*’ news of the day will be limited to searching the archive, not browsing the latest headlines. The researcher can choose *New York Times* as the source and select the date, but a search term must be entered for a list of stories/articles to be returned.

For this review, I hoped to compare the list of *New York Times* articles available in Factiva to the digital and print versions of the newspaper. This was possible using the “News Page”, but was not easy using the “Search” page. Articles available for October 8, 2013, displayed on the “News Page” were identical to the print and pre-noon digital content found on the three mobile devices. Factiva also now provides access to the *New York Times Digital* (nytimes.com) feed, but I did not investigate how many times each day Factiva downloads content from that feed. Images attached to stories/articles are not available, as is the case in all of the news-aggregated databases examined for this comparative review.
News Aggregators Provide Access to Static Content: **Factiva**

The digital representation of print content is sent to aggregators once per day.

**The New York Times** via Factiva can be accessed two ways:

**Browsing the “News Pages”**

**Searching the *New York Times* Archive via “Search” Page**

---

Content can not be browsed using the search function. It must begin with a search.

To compare content across platforms, I searched for the letter “a”, but it didn’t yield any article about the “GOP Moderate,” Mr. Dent. Searching by keywords, title or byline yields the best results.

Using the “Search” page to create a list of articles from a single publication on a particular date is not effective.

---

**Figure 7**

[Image of Factiva’s News Pages]

---

**Figure 8**

[Image of Factiva’s Search Page]
News Aggregators Provide Access to Static Content: ProQuest

ProQuest Newsstand’s advanced search feature (Figure 9) allows for searching the archive and for browsing a list of articles from a specific publication on a specific day. The researcher does not have to insert a search term to generate a list of articles (Figure 10). The articles represent the East Coast late edition news feed, duplicating the same list of articles found in the print and early digital editions.

ProQuest allows content browsing by searching only the publication title and date.

Figure 9

Figure 10
News Aggregators Provide Access to Static Content: Lexis Nexis Academic

Browsing all of the content from The New York Times on October 8, 2013, is difficult in L/N.

Using the “Advanced Search” feature (Figure 11) allows the users to search by publication and date yielding a long list (Figure 12) that tedious to browse, making it difficult to determine if all of the articles in the print edition were in L/N. Searching specifically for an article by title, yielded positive results (Figure 13).

Content, once again, is from the digital news feed representing a print edition minus images and graphics.
News Aggregators Provide Access to Static Content

News aggregators are excellent repositories of text-only stories. There are times when browsing article titles is important. All three news aggregators that I tested offer that opportunity. None of the three offered graphics or images associated with the articles. Although corrections were added to some of the databases, the content is basically static.

The dynamic nature of New York Times Digital (nytimes.com) content has increased consumer expectations for news content to be as dynamic and experiential as the world it represents (Figures 2,3,4). Multimedia and infographics create rich educational and artistic experiences for the news consumer that neither the print nor aggregated content can.

Analytics Allows News Organizations to Find Success in the Digital Space

The dynamic nature of nytimes.com content has increased consumer expectations for news content to be as dynamic as the world it represents. Multimedia and infographics create rich educational and artistic experiences for the news consumer that neither the print nor aggregated content can. When real time site analysis is added to the mix, digital news providers can create personal experiences for the consumer based on the way each interacts with the content. Foreign and formerly forbidden space for the journalist, news organizations are creating teams of “engagement” specialists who monitor every inch of their digital space in real time. To survive the new world of experiential news, organizations have become experts in analyzing consumer news consumption behavior. This new and sometimes uncomfortable partnership may allow quality journalism to survive as new business models emerge.

According to Paul Smurl, General Manager of Core Digital Products for The New York Times Company, the more engaged, committed and loyal users are across platforms, the “more valuable they are from both an advertising and a subscription perspective.”

Smurl explains in an interview with eMarketer, a market research aggregator for digital media, that mobile usage of the New York Times Digital product is heaviest in the morning before consumers head out the door. They take their smartphone on their commute. At work, computers may be the work tool of choice, but tablet usage picks up in the evening as entertainment or a second screen device.

Smurl knows this because of New York Times Digital’s heavy use of analytics.
The New York Times is Consistently Ranked as a Top Web, Mobile and Print Property

According to eMarketer and ComScore (provider of digital business analytics), the New York Times consistently ranks in the top 10 Web, mobile and print media properties (Figures 14, 15, 16, 17, 18).
ComScore Top 100 News/Information Properties September 2013

NYTimes.com is ranked 9th in News/Information Internet Properties Based on Total Number of Unique Visitors:
ComScore Media Metrics Key Measures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Media Name</th>
<th>Total Unique Visitors (000)</th>
<th>% Reach</th>
<th>% Corruption Uniq Visits</th>
<th>Composition Index (UV)</th>
<th>Composition Index (IV)</th>
<th>Average Daily Visitors</th>
<th>Total Minutes (MM)</th>
<th>Total Pages Viewed (MM)</th>
<th>Total Visitors (000)</th>
<th>Average Minutes per Visit</th>
<th>Average Visits per User</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Internet: Total Audience</td>
<td>225,271</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>117,036</td>
<td>453,478</td>
<td>604,751</td>
<td>10,835,458</td>
<td>23.1</td>
<td>74.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Comscore</td>
<td>216,342</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>105,627</td>
<td>21,707</td>
<td>22,392</td>
<td>6,203,271</td>
<td>23.1</td>
<td>74.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. NYTimes.com</td>
<td>192,970</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>78,970</td>
<td>570,438</td>
<td>704,844</td>
<td>8,423,430</td>
<td>23.1</td>
<td>74.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Reddit</td>
<td>185,161</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>59,485</td>
<td>298,465</td>
<td>323,256</td>
<td>4,901,774</td>
<td>23.1</td>
<td>74.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. HackerNews</td>
<td>128,522</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>28,987</td>
<td>152,245</td>
<td>265,510</td>
<td>3,574,150</td>
<td>23.1</td>
<td>74.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. LinkedIn</td>
<td>440,219</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>175,007</td>
<td>1,609,339</td>
<td>1,743,790</td>
<td>30,909,903</td>
<td>23.1</td>
<td>74.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Twitter</td>
<td>426,263</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>147,007</td>
<td>1,380,629</td>
<td>1,578,190</td>
<td>29,009,000</td>
<td>23.1</td>
<td>74.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Reddit</td>
<td>214,930</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>75,630</td>
<td>377,853</td>
<td>453,478</td>
<td>6,203,271</td>
<td>23.1</td>
<td>74.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. HackerNews</td>
<td>185,161</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>59,485</td>
<td>298,465</td>
<td>323,256</td>
<td>4,901,774</td>
<td>23.1</td>
<td>74.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. LinkedIn</td>
<td>440,219</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>175,007</td>
<td>1,609,339</td>
<td>1,743,790</td>
<td>30,909,903</td>
<td>23.1</td>
<td>74.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Twitter</td>
<td>426,263</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>147,007</td>
<td>1,380,629</td>
<td>1,578,190</td>
<td>29,009,000</td>
<td>23.1</td>
<td>74.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 18
Excerpts from Alliance for Audited Media:

Latest New York Times’ Publisher’s Statement (3/2012)

Digital Circulation is Now 48% of Total Print and Digital Circulation

The New York Times

New York, New York

www.nytimes.com

Figure 19
NYTimes.com Website Analysis by Alexa.com

- **Global Visitor Stats**
- **Ranking: Domestic & Global**
- **Bounce Rate, Page Views, Time on Site**
- **Visitor Demographics**
- **Visitors Come from Here**
- **Visitors Like These Sections**
- **Slow Website Load Time**
- **Sites Linking to NYTimes.com**
- **Other NYT Domains Pointing to NYTimes.com**
- **Popularity as a News Website**

**Figure 20**
According to ComScore MyMetrix Media Dashboard for September 2013:

New York Times Digital had:
- 32,234 Unique Visitors in September 2013
  - 55% less than September 2012 (Figure 21)
- 4,703 Daily Visitors
- Visitors Stayed an Average of 4.6 Min/Visit
- Visitors Viewed 615 Pages
- The Majority of Visitors Came from the U.S.

New York Times Digital Demographics:
- Visitors are Mostly Male (over 54%)
- Most Visitors are Between 25-34 Years of Age
  - Many Between Ages 18-64
- Household Incomes Generally Exceed $100,000
- Over 50% Do Not Have Children
- Most Common Household Size= 2
- Ethnicity = Over 90% “Other” (Not Hispanic Nor Black)

New York Times Digital Advertising:
- Advertisers:
  - Over 54% - Automobiles
  - Remainder- Finance, Technology, Education, etc.
- New York Times Digital Advertises on:
  - Social Media
  - News/Information
  - Sports
  - Retail
  - Business/Finance
While Internet and news/information unique visitors have increased over the year, *New York Times Digital's* unique visitors have decreased (Figures 21, 22). This may explain why they are aggressively seeking a new international subscription base.
New York Times is Investing in Journalism and Counting on New Digital Subscriptions

The New York Times Company has been shedding its investments and major outside holdings (Figure 23) and will soon be “stripped down to its central product – New York Times journalism,” according to Christine Haughney, in her recent nytimes.com article: “A Leaner Times Aims for Global Growth” (October 14, 2013). This week the Company introduced a new product: The International New York Times, “a central component of a stepped-up global growth strategy.”

In Haughney’s article, Mark Thompson, The New York Times Company’s president and chief executive, said, “If we can get the combination of new products that we’re doing and the international strategy to significantly increase consumer revenue, that could be of real significance.”

Video will become increasingly important in creating long-form documentaries, original series, etc. They see it playing a very important part in digital advertising as well.

The New York Times Company sees increased paid circulation rather than relying on the traditional advertising business model as a key to their future success. That may explain why academic site licenses are so important to the New York Times. Academic institutions provide a huge potential subscription base. The value-added content only available on the Web and mobile platforms provide access to dynamic current information, very different content than that found in digital aggregated news archives like Factiva, ProQuest Newsstand and Lexis Nexis.

The value of the New York Times Digital products extends much farther than access to news. It’s arts, politics, business and finance sections, to name a few, are regarded as some of the highest quality information sources available. For the academic market, they provide value across many disciplines. News aggregators are invaluable for searching text news archives, but the dynamic nature of this multiplatform product makes it an important product across the academy.

It is important that the New York Times Company understands that the academic community values its products. However, they must also understand that the we know that the academic market provides them a potential subscriber base that extends much farther than the academy. Each year thousands of students graduate and become potential individual subscribers.
New York Times is Investing in Journalism and Counting on New Digital Subscriptions

A Slimmed-Down Newsroom

The New York Times Company shed many assets and trimmed its payroll following a steep decline in revenue.

But after a huge loss in 2008, the company has been posting more profits than losses and its online and mobile business strategy has greatly helped to increase its paid circulation.

Figure 23
Sources


Dorothy Carner
Head, Journalism Libraries
102 Reynolds Journalism Institute
University of Missouri
Columbia, MO 65203
carnerd@missouri.edu
573 882-6591